

**APPENDIX 1**

**PROMOTION CRITERIA MATRIX**

**Updated October 1, 2021**

NOTE: The Promotion Criteria Matrix is intended to present examples of various levels of accomplishment in the areas of teaching, scholarship, research, clinical activity and service. It is not an exhaustive list, but is intended to assist faculty, department chairs and promotion committees in matching candidates' accomplishments to the promotion criteria. Importantly, faculty members are not expected to have accomplishments in all, or even in most, areas. Rather, the matrix highlights a broad range of activities that will be recognized as "meritorious" or "excellent," reflecting the varied activities and accomplishments of our diverse faculty. Moreover, areas frequently overlap in practice, although they are presented as distinct entities here. It should also be noted that the matrix specifies just two categories, meritorious and excellent. Professors will need to achieve excellence by a number of criteria. Associate professors will have met fewer of these criteria or in not as great depth. Additionally, "excellence" generally signifies a higher level of accomplishment and leadership by the faculty member; "excellence" also implies that the work is recognized by peers or others as important and impactful. In particular, committee work and service activities should include documentation from committee chairs or others that the faculty member has made substantive contributions to the work over a sustained period of time. The promotion process, and this matrix, are meant to describe and reward continued professional growth and achievement.

<b>TEACHING</b>	
<b><u>Meritorious</u></b>	<b><u>Excellent</u></b>
Active participation in teaching activities of the department, school, campus or university, including two or more of the following: presenting a series of lectures covering one or more topics; acting as a primary instructor in a course; advising or mentoring students, residents or faculty; attending on an inpatient or outpatient service; organizing or facilitating a seminar series, journal clubs or laboratory exercises; participating as a teacher in continuing education activities.	Regularly assumes greater than average share of teaching duties –in classroom, laboratory, clinical or community settings.
	Regularly assumes greater than average share of administrative or service responsibilities related to teaching. Examples might include leading or contributing significantly to committees that focus on curriculum development, management or assessment.
Regular participation on committees that focus on curriculum development, management or assessment.	Demonstration of educational leadership (for example, by serving as a course, fellowship or training program director, curriculum committee chair or assistant or associate dean).
Meritorious teaching evaluations from students and peers.	Consistently receives excellent or outstanding teaching evaluations.
	Nomination for, or receipt of, honors or awards for excellence in teaching or mentorship.
Development or redevelopment of teaching materials for students, continuing education courses or other faculty training.	Recognition as an outstanding and influential role model for students, fellows, residents or other trainees.

<b>TEACHING (Continued)</b>	
<b><u>Meritorious</u></b>	<b><u>Excellent</u></b>
Invitations to present Grand Rounds or seminars here and at other institutions; invitations to present courses outside of primary department.	Record of successful mentorship of students, residents, fellows or other faculty, as measured by: letters of support from mentees; publications, presentations, grants, awards or other evidence of mentees' academic success; evidence that mentees have pursued outstanding careers.
Participation in workshops or training programs focusing on implicit bias, microaggressions, confronting racism, allyship or upstander training.	Development of mentoring or coaching programs that focus on career development, academic advancement or wellness and resiliency of students, residents, fellows or faculty.
Regular participation on committees that promote learners' awareness of health and healthcare disparities, marginalized or underserved communities, societal and healthcare racism or socioeconomic determinants of health.	Development of innovative teaching methods, such as educational websites, simulations, videotapes, packaged courses or workshops.
Regular participation on search committees, second-look or career day committees, pipeline program organizing committees or other committees focusing on recruitment, retention or support of trainees, faculty, staff or others who are under-represented in medicine or science.	Development of, or significant contributions to, courses, service-learning activities or other educational programs that focus on: health and healthcare disparities; societal and healthcare racism; socioeconomic determinants of health; or optimizing care for marginalized patients and populations, including those defined by race, ethnicity, language, culture, gender, gender identity, sexual orientation or disability
Regular participation on committees that address other challenges in education, such as training of scientists, assessment of learning outcomes, professionalism, promoting inclusive learning environments for individuals with disabilities, or developing educational technology.	Consistent record of advocacy for diversity, inclusion and equity in the education of health professionals. Examples might include leadership of recruitment, pipeline or diversity programs or significant mentorship of learners or colleagues who are under-represented in the health professions.
Participation as a mentor on a training grant.	
Self-improvement activities (for example, participation in workshops or courses that are designed to improve teaching or mentoring effectiveness).	Leadership of, or significant contributions to, activities or programs that address other challenges in education, such as: training of scientists; assessment of competencies or learning outcomes; professionalism; promoting inclusive learning environments for learners with disabilities; or developing educational technology.

<b>TEACHING (continued)</b>	
<b><u>Meritorious</u></b>	<b><u>Excellent</u></b>
	Teaching in unusually challenging circumstances (for example, during a disaster or public health emergency, in remote or resource-constrained communities or countries, or teaching English-as-second language or special needs learners).
	Successful leadership of local, regional or national continuing education courses.
	Consistent participation in national educational activities (for example, residency review committees, programs sponsored by professional organizations, re-certification courses or workshops).
	Invitations to be a visiting professor at other institutions.
	Development of innovative courses, high-quality syllabi, novel lectures, problem-based learning cases, laboratory exercises, on-line or remote teaching resources or other instructional materials.
	Leadership of, or significant contributions to, the development of certifying, credentialing or qualifying examinations for students, residents, fellows or practicing clinicians.
	Evidence of teaching scholarship (for example, research, grants, publications or national presentations that focus on understanding the best methods or outcomes of teaching).

<b>CLINICAL ACTIVITY</b>	
<b><u>Meritorious</u></b>	<b><u>Excellent</u></b>
Active and effective participation in clinical activities of the academic unit.	<p>Regularly assumes greater than average share of clinical duties, as measured by patient care or procedure logs, RVUs, clinical billing statistics, requests for consultations, willingness to cover overflow services, complexity of patients managed or other measures of clinical effort, as appropriate for the specialty.</p> <p>Regularly assumes greater than average share of administrative or service responsibilities in support of the patient care programs of the department, hospital, school or university.</p> <p>Continuing, significant participation for an extended period of time in clinical activities that are highly effective, as measured by health outcomes, patient satisfaction or other quality measures, patient referrals from a wide region (as appropriate for the specialty), peer review of knowledge and clinical skills, contributions to inter-professional healthcare teams or successful collaborations across disciplines.</p> <p>Providing direct patient care in challenging or hazardous circumstances, such as during pandemics or public health emergencies or during deployments to resource-limited or hazardous locations overseas.</p> <p>Development of new techniques, therapies, clinical guidelines, clinical information systems, patient care practices or pathways or health care delivery systems that have improved the health of patients or populations.</p> <p>Creative, active participation in the evaluation of the effectiveness of care (quality, outcomes, patient safety, utilization, access, cost).</p> <p>Recognition for excellence in clinical activity at the local, regional, national or international level through letters of reference, honors, awards, institutional evaluations, invitations to speak regionally or nationally (for example, at CME conferences), requests to write reviews, etc.</p>
Board certification or recertification.	
Participation on committees or task forces that support the patient care programs of the department, hospital, school or university.	
Demonstration of clinical skills that are highly effective (e.g., mastery of important clinical techniques, high degree of patient satisfaction, evidence of high quality and efficient patient care).	
Active participation in clinical programs that address the needs of under-served or marginalized patients or populations.	
Support from peers at the site of practice.	
Invitations to speak on clinical topics on campus, or participation on institutional clinical care committees.	
Active participation in activities that promote health care quality and patient safety.	
Completion of self-improvement activities (for example, participation in workshops or continuing medical education activities that are designed to improve knowledge or clinical skills).	
Participation in workshops or training programs that address challenges in diversity and equity in clinical settings, including workshops focusing on implicit bias, microaggressions, confronting racism, allyship and upstander training.	

<b>CLINICAL ACTIVITY (continued)</b>	
<b><u>Meritorious</u></b>	<b><u>Excellent</u></b>
<p>Serving on a diversity, equity, inclusion and anti-racism-focused clinical committee within the department, school, hospital, university or regional or national organization.</p>	<p>Demonstration of effective leadership at the site of clinical practice – e.g., director of a clinical service, head of an inter-disciplinary patient care team, medical staff leader, credentialing committee chair, or head of a section, division or department.</p>
<p>Regular participation in community collaborations that strengthen educational, clinical or research partnerships.</p>	<p>Leadership of, or significant contributions to, workshops or training programs that address challenges in diversity and equity in clinical settings, including workshops focusing on implicit bias, microaggressions, confronting racism, allyship and upstander training.</p>
	<p>Assumption of a substantive leadership role at the regional level – e.g., chairing committees, organizing CME conferences, or serving as officer of local or statewide professional organizations.</p>
	<p>Appointment to community boards or other leadership positions in organizations that promote healthier communities and address the social, environmental and economic determinants of health.</p>
	<p>Assumption of a substantive clinical leadership role at the national or international level - e.g., chairing national symposia and meetings, chairing committees or serving as officer of national professional organizations or journal editor.</p>
	<p>Leadership of structured activities that promote healthcare quality and equity, effective teamwork, provider wellness and resiliency, patient safety or equity in the workplace.</p>

<b>CLINICAL ACTIVITY (continued)</b>	
<b><u>Meritorious</u></b>	<b><u>Excellent</u></b>
	Participation in significant self-assessment activities and clinical audits of one's own practice that have led to improvements in quality, equity, efficiency or outcomes of care.
	Significant involvement in health care advocacy, community service, community-based participatory research programs, or other activities that shape public policy on health care, address racism and inequities in the healthcare system or that address community health and healthcare needs.
	Evidence of health care-related scholarship (for example, grants, research publications, books or book chapters, significant case series or case reports, patient care guidelines or clinical information systems, authoritative review articles, national presentations, reports related to healthcare innovations or reports that promote healthcare quality or patient safety or that advance the science and practice of healthcare quality improvement.
	Recognition by trainees or professional colleagues (for example, pharmacists, nurses, advanced practice providers or practice managers) for possessing the attributes of an excellent clinician, such as knowledge, judgment, technical skill, teamwork, communication skill, compassion, respect and altruism.
	Recognition by patients for possessing the attributes of an excellent clinician, such as attentiveness, communication skill, compassion and respect.
	Nomination for, or receipt of, honors or awards for clinical excellence or professionalism.

## RESEARCH and SCHOLARSHIP

This section of the Promotion Matrix presents examples of the scholarship of discovery, teaching, integration and application. The Matrix specifies only two categories (“meritorious” and “excellent”). The line between “meritorious” and “excellent” scholarship may not be easy to define; however, excellence in scholarship generally signifies a higher level of accomplishment and implies that the work meets one or more of the following tests: *Recognition*: the work is recognized as excellent by peers; *Impact and importance*: it has contributed to an improved understanding of the discipline; *Coherence*: the publications, innovative curricula or other scholarly products represent a coherent body of work; and *Creative Leadership*: there is evidence of creativity and leadership by the faculty member.

There may be considerable overlap between scholarship and other areas of faculty accomplishment (teaching, clinical activity and service). However, as defined in the *Rules*, “the products of all scholarship must be in a format that can be evaluated, which would normally mean a written format, but could include web-based or electronic formats.”

### SCHOLARSHIP OF DISCOVERY (RESEARCH)

**The “scholarship of discovery” refers to traditional, hypothesis-driven research that results in the generation of new knowledge. Successful “discovery scholarship” usually results in peer-reviewed scientific publications.**

<u>Meritorious</u>	<u>Excellent</u>
Authorship or co-authorship of papers in peer-reviewed journals that demonstrate the ability to generate and test hypotheses and represent a significant contribution to the published literature.	A consistent level of peer-reviewed or other funding for research awarded in a competitive manner over a sustained period of time.
Serving as a collaborator in a basic science, clinical, translational or other research program.	Designs and directs a basic, clinical, translational, program evaluation or other research program and plays a major role in writing up the results.
Co-investigator status on grants.	Demonstrated evidence of originality as an investigator, with evidence that the faculty member’s research has deepened understanding in relevant scientific discipline(s) and has advanced knowledge or the practical application of that knowledge,
A principal and sustained role in the management of a research program with external funding.	

**SCHOLARSHIP OF DISCOVERY (RESEARCH) (continued)**

<b><u>Meritorious</u></b>	<b><u>Excellent</u></b>
<p>Presentations at national meetings; invited research seminars at this and other institutions; service as an ad hoc member on study sections.</p>	<p>Success as a team scientist. Success may include: significant independent intellectual contributions to successful research programs; contributing distinct expertise (for example, in one or more biological sciences, epidemiology, statistics, computational biology, qualitative or mixed-methods research, community participatory research, clinical trials or other areas) that result in important discoveries and publications; contributing critical skills, expertise and effort as a co-investigator that result in sustained competitive research funding; or contributions to research teams that result in new insights, break boundaries, promote technology development or lead to new discoveries..</p>
<p>Service as an ad-hoc reviewer for a medical or scientific journal.</p>	
<p>Facilitates the research programs of the SOM by serving as a regular member of the Institutional Animal Care and Use Committee (IACUC), the Colorado Multiple Institutional Review Board (COMIRB), the COMIRB Scientific Advisory Committee (SARC) or other relevant research-related committees.</p>	
	<p>An ongoing record of first- or senior-author publications in peer-reviewed journals that: a) represent significant contributions to the published literature; b) demonstrate the ability to generate or test hypotheses; and c) demonstrate originality and independence as an investigator or represent significant independent intellectual contributions to successful research programs. Team scientists should have an ongoing, peer-reviewed publication record that includes first-, middle- or senior-author publications, with documentation that the faculty member has made substantial and unique contributions to the conception or design of the publications, acquisition, analysis and interpretation of the data, and/or writing of the manuscript.</p>
	<p>Principal investigator status on competitive peer-reviewed research grants (for example: K08, K23 or similar mentored awards from NIH or private foundations for associate professors; R01, R21, P01, P30, P50 or similar independent awards for professors). These examples should be considered as guides, as funding expectations vary across disciplines and departments. In general, greatest weight is given to funding that is sustained, that has led to impactful research and that indicates a high likelihood of future competitive funding.</p>

**SCHOLARSHIP OF DISCOVERY (RESEARCH) (continued)**

<b><u>Meritorious</u></b>	<b><u>Excellent</u></b>
	<p>Service as an editor, section editor or editorial board member for a medical or scientific journal (including a written summary of the faculty member's activities and contributions to the success of the journal).</p>
	<p>Service as a regular member on a scientific study sections.</p>
	<p>Regularly assumes greater than average share of administrative or service responsibilities related to research. Examples might include leading or making exceptional contributions to the Institutional Animal Care and Use Committee (IACUC), the Colorado Multiple Institutional Review Board (COMIRB), the COMIRB Scientific Advisor Committee (SARC) or other University or hospital research institutes, organizations or cores.</p>
	<p>A national or international reputation, as evidenced by: external letters of reference; invitations to present at national or international meetings; invitations to write reviews or chapters, or to provide unique expertise as a collaborator on a research project; visiting professorships; service as a regular member on study sections; organization of national meetings; or service as a national consultant or on editorial boards of journals.</p>
	<p>Development of a significant number of patents.</p>

**SCHOLARSHIP OF APPLICATION**

The “scholarship of application” includes activities that build bridges between theory and practice or that apply knowledge to practical problems. Examples include development of new medical treatment modalities, clinical care pathways, or other activities that address community health care needs, that shape public policy on health care or that that promote quality of care and patient safety and advance the science and practice of health care quality improvement.

<b><u>Meritorious</u></b>	<b><u>Excellent</u></b>
Active participation in activities that promote health care quality, cost-efficiency, access or patient safety within the institution (provides documentation of interventions and outcomes).	Leadership of projects that have improved the quality of care, cost-efficiency, access, or patient safety locally, nationally or internationally (provides documentation of interventions and outcomes).
Co-authorship of articles, policy reports or other publications related to clinical or health services topics.	A record of multiple publications related to clinical, health services or health systems science topics, which may include clinical trials, investigative reports, case studies, policy reports or other publications that have advanced the science and practice of health care quality improvement.
	Articles, white papers or other written or electronic products of scholarship that focus on health care advocacy, equity, community service or community-based participatory research or other activities that shape public policy on health care or that address health disparities.
	Other evidence of clinical scholarship (for example, research, authoritative review articles, grants, contributions to clinical information systems, publications or national presentations) that promote health care quality, equity or patient safety or that advance the science and practice of health care quality improvement.
	Development of new techniques, therapies, clinical guidelines, patient care practices or pathways or health care delivery systems that have improved the health of patients or populations.

### SCHOLARSHIP OF INTEGRATION

The “scholarship of integration” (horizontal scholarship) includes creative syntheses or analyses that define “connections across disciplines” or bring new insights to bear on original research. The scholarship of integration seeks to interpret, analyze and draw together the results of the original research. Review articles and book chapters are examples of the scholarship of integration.

<u>Meritorious</u>	<u>Excellent</u>
Co-authorship of articles integrating knowledge in a field and assessing overall value of discoveries in relationship patient care, teaching or other areas.	Consistent record of senior-author review or other scholarly products; these reviews or other integrative works represent a major body of scholarship that provides a demonstrable national or international reputation.
Publication of review articles, book chapters, case series or other reports that integrate knowledge and put new discoveries into perspective.	Consistent record of creative scholarship in the visual arts, literature, music or other domains reflecting on the human experience of health, illness or healthcare.

### SCHOLARSHIP OF TEACHING

The “scholarship of teaching” focuses on the development of new teaching methods, assessments of learning outcomes and preparation and dissemination of highly effective curricula or other instructional materials.

<u>Meritorious</u>	<u>Excellent</u>
Improvement or expansion of an existing course or curriculum.	Development of innovative courses, high-quality syllabi, novel lectures, problem-based learning cases, laboratory exercises, on-line or distance teaching resources or other instructional materials.
Facilitates the educational programs of the SOM through ongoing and substantive contributions to the Student Admissions Committee. Participation must include submission of end-of-year reports reflecting on knowledge and insights gained from admissions committee meetings and applicant interviews or discussion of applicant recruitment, measures of applicant readiness, premed advising, pipeline activities, class diversity or other relevant challenges and topics. A supporting letter from the Assistant Dean for Admissions is required.	Development of innovative teaching methods, such as educational websites, simulations, videotapes, packaged courses or workshops, etc.
	A strong record of first- or senior-author publications in health professions education.
	Other evidence of teaching scholarship (for example, research, grants or national presentations that focus on understanding the best methods, or outcomes, of teaching).

**SCHOLARSHIP OF TEACHING (continued)**

<b><u>Meritorious</u></b>	<b><u>Excellent</u></b>
	Leadership or substantive contributions to the development of certifying examinations for students, residents or fellows or assessments of practicing clinicians for certification or credentialing.
	Development of innovative mentoring, coaching or career development programs for trainees, recognized on a local, national or international level.

<b>SERVICE</b>	
<b><u>Meritorious</u></b>	<b><u>Excellent</u></b>
Service on committees or task forces within the program, division, department, school, campus or university.	Regularly assumes greater than average share of administrative responsibilities, including service to the School, University, professional discipline or community.
Service to local, state, national or international organizations through committee membership, education, consultation or other roles.	Appointment to leadership positions within the institution, such as: chair of a committee; faculty officer; program director; course or curriculum director; academic clinical coordinator; or membership on major decision-making School of Medicine or Anschutz Medical Campus committees.
Contributing to departmental, School of Medicine, hospital or university programs that focus on diversity, equity, inclusion and anti-racism, through service on committees, coordinating events or participating in pipeline or tutoring programs or outreach activities.	Service as an officer or task force or committee chair in clinical, educational, scientific or nonprofit organizations.
Participation on committees or task forces that focus on supporting learners, patients, professional colleagues or others who have been historically marginalized in terms of race, ethnicity, language, culture, gender identity, sexual orientation or presence of one or more mobility, visual, hearing, neurological, psychological or other disabilities.	Significant involvement in health care advocacy, community service or outreach, community-based participatory research programs, or other activities that shape public policy on health care or that address health disparities.
Service as an article reviewer for clinical, educational or scientific journals.	Leadership of activities or programs that address challenges in education, such as workforce diversity, training of scientists, assessment of competencies or learning outcomes, mentorship, professionalism or educational technology.
	Leadership of, or significant contributions to, programs that support learners, patients, professional colleagues, or others who have been historically marginalized in terms of race, ethnicity, language, culture, gender identity, sexual orientation or presence of one or more mobility, visual, hearing, neurological, psychological or other disabilities.
	Service as a member of a scientific study section, or service as an editor or editorial board member of a professional or scientific journal.

<b>SERVICE (continued)</b>	
<b><u>Meritorious</u></b>	<b><u>Excellent</u></b>
	Appointment to leadership positions dealing with scientific, health care or educational issues at the local, state, regional, national or international levels.
	Appointment to community boards and other leadership positions that address community health needs or health inequities.
	Service awards from the University or from a local, national, or international organization (civic, scientific or professional).